Desert Tortoise Council
Minutes of the Board of Directors Meeting

6 January 2018
Sam’s Town Hotel and Gambling Hall
Las Vegas, Nevada

CALL TO ORDER

The meeting was called to order by Chairperson, Bruce Palmer at 10:00 a.m. Action items are in blue, with responsible parties in red. Motions made, seconded, and approved (or not) are shown in bold red font.


A. Introductions: Tracy Bailey was introduced as overseeing Symposium logistics.

B. Review Agenda: New issues were incorporated as needed.

C. Meeting Minutes of 28 October 2017: Ed LaRue prepared draft minutes at the last Board meeting in Las Vegas, NV, which were distributed, reviewed, and approved today as final. Motion made (Joe Probst), seconded (Ken MacDonald), and unanimously approved to accept the draft minutes as amended to be final.

D. Review of Board Actions since Last Board Meeting: None.

E. Next Meeting Date: The next meeting of the Board will be the Annual Business Meeting at Sam’s Town, Las Vegas, NV, at approximately 08:00 am, on 23 February 2018. The next Board of Directors meeting after that will be at 10:15 am on April 7, 2018 at the DoubleTree Hilton in Ontario, CA.

OFFICER/COMMITTEE REPORTS

F. Treasurer’s Report: The 2018 proposed budget and Treasurer’s Report were distributed by Joe Probst, showing total assets of $279,286.99 as of 12/31/2017. Motions made (Ken MacDonald), seconded (Greer Dolby), and unanimously approved to accept the Treasurer’s Report and approve the 2018 Proposed Budget as final. In the 2018 proposed budget, Joe raised the Board travel costs from $8,000 to $10,000 to accommodate increased costs associated with the 15-member Board. Later, we may need to increase the line items for grants to accommodate anticipated increased grant requests.
G. Corresponding Secretary’s Report: Several weeks ago Becky Jones provided the updated contact list for all officers and Board members. Given the complexity of the “History of the Board” spreadsheet that Bruce Palmer recently provided, Becky suggested that Bruce’s spreadsheet remain separate from the contact list that she maintains. Becky Jones will provide an updated contact list with a few changes identified today. Becky Jones and Kristin Berry will coordinate to provide a thank you letter to Ms. Benes for a donation to the Council. California Turtle and Tortoise Club (CTTC) recently provided a $5,000 donation to the Council. Council members are encouraged to serve as speakers at local CTTC chapters and acknowledge the donation. Speaker subject matter is variable, typically presented as a Power Point, and does not need to be about the Council.

H. Membership Coordinator’s/Membership Committee Report: According to Mari Quillman’s report, dated 1/4/2018, there are 428 total members, 356 active members, 76 overdue, and 68 lapsed members. Renewing memberships at the same time as registering for the Symposium is still a problematic issue. Mary Cohen is continuing to work with the Wild Apricot service to implement this feature. The definition of what constitutes a “renewal overdue” and a “lapsed” membership is still unclear. Mary Cohen has put in a request to Wild Apricot to get clarification. Mari also provided a detailed description of various membership categories, membership terms, etc. (see Section S below, for more detailed information).

I. Awards Committee Reports: Kristin Berry reported that she and the committee members (Becky Jones, Ed LaRue, Larry LaPré, with Chairperson, Bruce Palmer participating) had a telephone conference call several weeks ago where a full slate of (anonymous) awardees was identified and subsequently approved by the Chairperson.

J. Nominations Committee Report: Michael Tuma reported that officer elections for 2018 are for Corresponding Secretary and Treasurer. Becky Jones and Joe Probst, respectively, accepted our nominations to renew their positions. Board Member At Large terms for Kristin Berry, Maggie Fusari, and Pete Woodman expire as of the 2018 Annual Business Meeting. All three indicated their willingness to be nominated for new, three-year terms. Without specifically identifying individuals making motions and seconds, Kristin Berry, Maggie Fusari, and Peter Woodman were all unanimously nominated to serve new terms. Note that the Chairperson-elect is the functional chair of the Nominations Committee.

The process for selecting new Board members is (1) approaching a potential candidate and asking them if they would be interested in serving on the Board; (2) if an interest is expressed, then the candidate is vetted among the Nominations Committee members; (3) if the candidate is successfully vetted, an identified Board member then contacts them and extends a formal invitation, asking for a letter of interest and pertinent background information; and (4) the candidate is then invited to a Board meeting, where they are interviewed and a formal vote is taken by the Board to approve or deny the candidate’s request to join the Board. This process is less formal for committees, but loosely the same, without a formal vote.

K. Ecosystems Advisory Committee (EAC) Report: Ed LaRue reported that there were nine projects identified in the reporting period between 10/28/2017 and 1/6/2018, with three of them outstanding. Board input went from very good with seven members providing input on the Cuddeback Environmental Assessment to poor, with barely enough votes to endorse a letter to Edwards Air Force Base on a proposed solar site. Ed is concerned that there will be no one to comment on the PG&E Habitat Conservation Plan, for which he has to recuse himself. Larry LaPré indicated the document is thousands of pages long, and that PG&E’s approach would be a significant subsidy to common ravens in the Hinkley area. Larry LaPré agreed to take the lead on drafting the comment letter, which he will sign since Bruce Palmer and Ed LaRue have recused themselves.
L. Grants Committee Report: The Council expects products from selected awardees like updates, published papers, presentation of results at future Symposia, etc. (Michael Tuma plans on refining the Grants Guidelines to clarify our expectations with regards to products, among other things, which may result in two different documents or subsections of the guidelines). The following specific grant requests, including three new proposals submitted to the Council in the past several months, were discussed with final voting determinations indicated below.

1. The origins, genetic relatedness, and health status of desert tortoises in Anza-Borrego Desert State Park, California. Submitted by Jeffrey Manning and Gina Moran, California Department of Parks and Recreation, the request was for $9,587.12. After a discussion of merits and potential weaknesses of the proposal, the Board voted to approve the grant request, with one abstention (Becky Jones).

2. Keep Wild Tortoises Wild and Captive Tortoises Captive. The request was submitted by Kobbe Shaw, Tortoise Group, for $5,000. The request indicates they would receive $10,000 in matching funds from the USFWS. After a discussion of merits and potential weaknesses of the proposal, the Board voted to approve the grant request.

3. Establishing the First Free-Ranging Bolson Tortoise Populations in the US. The request was submitted by Christine Wiese, The Turner Endangered Species Fund, for $20,700 (year 1). After a discussion of merits and potential weaknesses of the proposal, the Board voted to deny the grant request, with three abstentions (Peter Woodman, Larry LaPré, and Mari Quillman).

4. Turtle Conservancy – response to preliminary request. There has been no additional information on this previous grant request, which was not specifically discussed.

5. Bolson tortoise land acquisition delay. We provided $20,000 in support of this acquisition, which is still ongoing.

6. Lockheed Martin grant award. There were no applications for the Lockheed Martin student award ($1,000) or the Morafka Award ($2,000). There may be an opportunity to provide money to high school students to attend the Basic Workshop with funds from the Lockheed Martin grant award. Maggie Fusari will take the lead on inviting students to attend the 2018 Basic Workshop using the Lockheed Martin grant award.

7. Glenn R. Stewart Student Travel Fund recipients. Halle Kohn and Molly Bechtel, who are both giving papers at the Symposium, are the two winners.

M. Information, Outreach, and Social Media Committee Report: Chris Noddings reported there are now more than 1,100 “likes” on Face Book. Michael Tuma will take the lead on linking the Facebook and Twitter accounts. Chris Noddings continues to pursue the Google grant. Michael has been involved in scanning in photographs that will lead to forming an Instagram account, which will be linked with Facebook.
N. Newsletter Editor’s Report: Michael Tuma reported that we still need a replacement editor as he moves into his new position as Chairperson at the 2018 Annual Business Meeting, unless we want to discontinue the newsletter.

O. Web Master’s Report: Michael Tuma reported that he continues to work on the website redesign. The next step is for Michael Tuma to identify pertinent committee members to review specific portions of the website and identify how to change the contents.

P. Agency Coordinating Committee: Cristina Jones provided a detailed letter from which the following information is taken.

1. Agency Coordination. Cristina Jones reported that thanks to assistance from Judy Hohman and Roy Averill-Murray, she is compiling a list of California-based federal agency biologists, and will seek input from Becky on State agencies/biologists (Cristina Jones still needs contacts from Caltrans, especially from Sacramento, which Judy Hohman will provide). Once complete, Cristina Jones will send the list to the Board to determine if it is comprehensive, and to select essential contacts for the Council and California agencies. It is her hope that we can schedule this meeting in conjunction with a Board meeting or a spring Recovery Implementation Team meeting to reduce travel costs. Friday, April 6, 2018 may be a good day to meet in California, since we are meeting in Ontario on April 7, 2018.

2. Large Scale Translocation Site (LSTS) Memorandum of Understanding (MOU). Peter Woodman tracked 23 tortoises on November 20 and December 12, 2017 at the LSTS; two tortoises that were last located in February 2017 remain missing, transmitters presumably failed early. Terry Christopher (GBI) provided information on transmitter attachment and estimated expiration dates, as well as MCL and sex on November 1, 2017. Seven transmitters need to be replaced in March/April 2018. Because only three of the 23 tortoises are female, we will likely conduct surveys in spring to transmitter additional females, rather than re-transmitter the seven males. We will also make an effort to better group the animals so they can all be tracked in one day. The revised MOU was signed by Glen Knowles (USFWS) and Bruce Palmer on November 13, 2017. The revised MOU supersedes the need for biologists approved by the Council to work on LSTS tortoises to apply for a Nevada Department of Wildlife Special Purpose Permit.

3. Authorized Biologist training review, makeup class, and next workshop. Scott Hoffmann (USFWS) mailed individual letters to the Authorized Desert Tortoise Biologist Training Course participants on December 11, 2017. A few participants contacted Scott asking how much additional experience they will need to become proficient; he mentioned that we are developing a handling course – and details will be announced to Authorized Biologists Course participants prior to public release. The course organizers and field instructors held a conference call on November 2, 2017. A follow-up call is scheduled for January 11, 2018.

Working with Scott Hoffman and Kimberleigh Field (USFWS), Cristina Jones is pursuing a tortoise handling course for the 16 people who did not pass the Authorized Biologist Course, which would take two to three days, possibly in conjunction with Linda Allison’s line-distance sampling training scheduled for March 20-22, 2018. Priority registration will be offered at a reduced cost for the 16 AB Course participants that require additional supervised desert tortoise handling. Jay Johnson, DVM would be available, at an hourly rate, to deliver a lecture on handling and disinfection as well as observe participants at a reduced travel cost. There are also six local qualified observers who can attend at no cost. Cristina Jones will develop a budget for this tortoise handling training and from that determine the fee for prospective students.
4. Health Assessment Training (HAT). Demand for a HAT course in 2018 seems quite low; Kimberleigh Field sent a poll via email to those who have expressed interest in the past to determine if there are enough participants to warrant a class. The course description was updated on the Council website on October 26, 2017, with instructions for those who meet the minimum requirements to contact Kimberleigh if they are interested in taking this course. Thus far, no one has contacted Kimberleigh. In lieu of a HAT course for new participants, we are going to focus our efforts on developing and holding a HAT refresher course in 2018. Kristina Drake, Kimberleigh Field, and Cristina Jones have a call scheduled for next week to discuss course content and logistics.

Q. 2018 Symposium Discussions: Tracy Bailey is here to help oversee logistics. Tracy needs two volunteers to work the lights during presentations (Greer Dolby will provide a name to Tracy). There are four people (Wendy Turner, Par Singhaseni, Molly Peters, and David Carr) whose registrations and rooms will be compensated. There are also six compensated speakers. Southern Nevada Environmental, Inc. (SNEI), Ironwood Consulting, NewFields, Jacobs Engineering, POWER Engineers, Inc., Solution Strategies Inc., and ECORP have been identified as sponsors. Mari Quillman will contact SNEI to determine what they will be providing at the Friday night mixer (e.g., food, drinks, or both?)

Kristin Berry provided a rough draft of the program, including speakers and their presentations, which will continue to change. Al Muth and Bruce Palmer will continue to serve as Meeting Chairs. She expects to finish up midday on Sunday, February 25, 2018. Both Joe Probst (with ±110) and Tracy Bailey (with 300) will bring folders, onto which Council logo stickers can be placed. Peter Woodman has already ordered Chums, which will be sent to Joe. Joe currently has some raffle tickets appropriate for the 50/50 raffle. Mari Quillman indicated that a drone has been ordered, which will have a higher raffle cost (e.g., $5) for this higher ticket item; Tracy Bailey will bring a box for the 50/50 raffle. There will also be individual raffle items where the tickets are applied to specific items. Mari Quillman will produce a list of raffle items that she will provide for Board approval and input. Each participant will receive a single ticket that will apply to raffle items to be distributed between sessions. ● The above will require four different colored tickets, which Joe Probst will acquire. Joe Probst will continue to oversee the photo contest (will need four poster boards for the contest) and will bring along the banners. GPS units, motion cameras, wind meters, etc. are field items that will likely be popular. The dollar limits for raffle items ($1,000) and auction items ($1,000) are set forth in the 2018 budget. There was a motion (Bruce Palmer), seconded (Ken MacDonald), and approved to provide up to $200 to Maggie Fusari for framing and a Native American pot. ● Mari Quillman will produce the slide show that depicts raffle and auction items, poster boards acknowledging sponsors, etc. She will need five or six easels, which are rented by Sam’s Town on a day-by-day basis. Ed LaRue will contact Tim Thomas and Pam MacKay about selling desert flower field guides (we should charge $5 per book over the $20 cost). ● Maggie Fusari will be in charge of bringing along books for sale, based on what was and was not sold last year. ● Pete Woodman is in charge of the field trip, with an email already sent to Scott Abella to visit one of his restoration sites. An alternative field trip could be the BrightSource facility at Ivanpah Valley. The field trip needs to be determined ASAP to facilitate attendance and accommodations. Tracy plans on providing the same menu as last year, both for breaks and meals. Six vendors have already signed up to participate. Tracy Bailey will add the Council to the vendor’s list, which will require a fulltime volunteer (already arranged). ● Maggie Fusari will work with David Carr to purchase a lapel microphone. Everyone is encouraged to meet in this room at 16:00 on Thursday, February 22, 2018 to pack folders.
2019 Symposium Discussions. Cristina Jones continues to look for potential speakers for the 2019 Symposium in Tucson. Cristina Jones will prepare a slide that will be shown at the 2018 Symposium to promote the 2019 event. ● Mari Quillman will send a sponsorship form to Cristina Jones so Cristina can begin to secure local sponsors. ● Greer Dolby will take the lead on soliciting posters from Arizona university students. Maggie indicated that the Tucson Herpetological Society has expressed their interest in participating.

R. Basic Workshop: Maggie Fusari reported there were 90 attendees at the Council Introductory Course on November 11-12, 2017 (compared to 84 in 2016). Of the 90 participants, three were local teachers auditing the course, and two of them are attending the 2018 Symposium. Eighty-one completed the online test. Jeremy is now grading those tests and we expect to have letters out by January 20, 2018. The course went very well as usual thanks to all the people who gave of their time. Thank you letters to them will go out next week. Maggie Fusari will have a report on overall spending and profit by the 2018 Symposium business meeting. We will have a change of venue in 2018. The Springhill Suites room is no longer available. Thanks to efforts by Tracy Bailey we have reserved the Half Hall Pinnacles Room at the Kerr McGee Center in Ridgecrest at 100 West California Ave, scheduled for 3-4 November 2018. We will begin making arrangements for reduced motel rates, coffee breaks, registration, outreach to teachers, and other items soon after the 2018 Symposium. Maggie Fusari will bring the 2017 course evaluations to the 2018 Symposium.

OLD/NEW BUSINESS

S. Membership Committee Policy Development: Mari Quillman referred to the most recent report (see Section H above) and provided detailed notes on Membership Committee issues. The 83 new members recently added pertain to the 2017 Basic Workshop students. Mary Cohen is working with Wild Apricot to determine the function differences between “lapsed members” and “renewal overdue memberships.” Another persisting problem is membership renewal at the time the Symposium registration is received. Mari Quillman, Joe Probst, and Maggie Fusari will arrange a conference call with Mary Cohen to discuss many of these persisting issues.

Mari Quillman looked at other organizations and concluded, among other things, that we need to increase our membership dues. Currently, each person’s membership is based on when they pay, which is problematic with regards to timing relative to the Symposia dates. If we choose to change membership to a calendar year, students attending the Basic Workshop would be members for the rest of the calendar year plus the next year; so a cutoff date needs to be identified (if purchased after November 1, membership would apply to 14 months or parts thereof); and, if they are already members, then they would be credited another year as members. There was a general consensus that we need to change membership to calendar year. We currently have four membership categories: student ($20), regular ($30), organization ($125), and lifetime members ($500) with the same benefits for all categories.

New benefits for members could include advanced notification of workshops and special events, reduced fees for selected workshops (e.g., Basic Workshop) and special events, voting privileges at the Annual Business Meeting (e.g., nonmembers cannot vote), advanced notice of grants and scholarship programs, restricted access to the membership directory, and free raffle ticket at the Symposia (already done). All agreed that we could not provide discounts on swag items because Council costs are very close to the manufacturer’s costs. Most Board members agreed that we
increase our Regular Membership rate from $30 to $40 and Organization Membership from $125 to $250, in part, because we have not increased rates in years, we are providing relatively more money in grants, Symposium costs continue to increase, etc. New benefits for organizational membership would be (1) to allow two individuals to attend Symposia at membership rates and (2) company logos would be posted on our website and in the newsletter. Mari Quillman will work with Mary Cohen to place company logos on the website for Symposia donors and will send the 2018 Symposium announcement to identified universities and other organizations.

T. Highways and Tortoises: Bruce Palmer indicated he intended to bring up tortoise fences along highways at the Management Oversight Group (MOG) December 2017 meeting, but was unable to do so due to flight delays. Kristin Berry reported on some research on how tortoises are impacted by roads in California. Maggie Fusari still plans to develop a paragraph on the issue of road impacts and the importance of fencing. ● Becky Jones is still looking for successful listing petitions under the California Endangered Species Act. We still intend to petition California Fish and Game Commission to list Agassiz’s desert tortoise as endangered, through a nexus with road impacts and the lack of fencing.

U. Bylaws amendment – Grants Committee: Bruce Palmer presented the intent to amend Section 11 of the Grants Committee section of the Bylaws. The motion was made (Michael Tuma), seconded (Greer Dolby), and unanimously approved to adopt the modified Bylaws with regards to the Grants Committee Guidelines. ● Bruce Palmer will post the revision on the website for membership consideration and potential adoption at the Annual Business Meeting.

V. How to Attract Student Members? Maggie Fusari’s work with educators and high school students in association with the Basic Workshop will help. Several Board members indicated it would be a good idea to establish a student outreach committee.

W. Bren School project status: Chris Noddings reported that Joe Probst has received the check for a $7,500 donation that would go to restoration, which could cost about $50,000 for the initial project. Desert Tortoise Preserve Committee (DTPC) may build its own nursery to grow seedling plants, which could reduce the overall cost if successful. Several members suggested that Chris contact both Mojave Desert Land Trust and Transition Habitat Conservancy about establishing a nursery or using existing nursery stock (depending on where the nursery plant seeds were collected).

Chris indicated a USFWS grant, through the RIT process, would be substantial and would be received, if at all, in spring 2018. Judy Hohman will work with Chris Noddings to research federal funding sources for performing restoration. Chris suggested initiating a new effort to implement the Bren School restoration project at another location, using the restoration plan and habitat restoration tool products resulting from the initial project. And, perhaps have a business branch of the Bren School work on producing a business plan for establishing a nursery, which could support restoration work at the Desert Tortoise Research Natural Area (DTRNA). Chris Noddings will contact the Bren School to see if the “Eco E” program may be interested in pursuing the business-related project mentioned above and report back to us about the feasibility. Kristin Berry indicated that Saharan mustard has recently been identified as occurring at the DTRNA, which could be a new focus by the Bren School.

Y. Betty Burge memorial: Ken MacDonald reported that Springs Preserve is interested in this memorial but suggested a $50,000 donation to display “Betty Burge” at the top of a prominent sign. For $10,000, which has already been approved, a small plaque commemorating Betty can be erected. All agreed that the plaque should show Betty’s image and that it would be installed for the previously-approved $10,000.

Z. Fund raising: Not discussed.

AA. Follow-up retreat? Such a meeting could help us determine how to increase our effectiveness. Most agreed that every five years is a good interval for a retreat, which would be in 2019.

BB. Committee reports for Annual Business Meeting: Bruce Palmer reminded us that all committee chairs are responsible to provide a summary report at the Annual Business Meeting of their activities during 2017. These reports are due to him from all Committee Chairs by January 13, 2018.

Adjourn: The meeting was adjourned by Chairperson, Bruce Palmer, at 16:10.

Draft minutes were recorded, later distributed and modified with Board member review and input, then respectfully submitted as this final version by Ed LaRue, Recording Secretary.

Edward L. LaRue, Jr.
Desert Tortoise Council, Recording Secretary
Ecosystems Advisory Committee Report
DTC Board Meeting of 6 January 2018

Note: The table attached to this report on the last page follows the bold red numbered outline given below.

1. San Bernardino County is embarking on a Regional Conservation Investment Strategy (RCIS)  
   11/2/2017 – On 11/2/2017, Paul Smith with San Bernardino County contact Ed LaRue about this project. Unable to attend the meeting on 11/7/2017, Larry LaPré attended and provided the following description on 11/9/2017. RCIS is a program sponsored by the California Department of Fish and Wildlife. The ultimate objective is to have in place mitigation lands and measures that can apply to all pertinent projects. The first two areas of the County to be studies are the Valley and the West Mojave, with the Mountains and East Mojave coming later, funding permitting. A large, experienced, and diverse group of stakeholders has been formed, called the Environmental Element Group. This is a planning effort that will involve several meetings, and is comparable to the BLM’s West Mojave Plan. Expedited permitting and effective conservation are the goals. At this stage, the group has devised a species list and plan area boundaries. Important tortoise habitat north and west of Barstow is included. No follow-up meeting dates have been set.

2. Proposed Development near Ivins, Utah  
   11/10/2017 – On 11/10/2017, Utah resident, Mike Scott, sent an email to Ed LaRue expressing concern about a planned development in Ivins, Utah. Ed spoke to Mr. Scott on 11/11/2017, suggesting that he contact Washington County planning department to be sure that the appropriate level of environmental review has been completed for the project, and possibly contact Cameron Rognan to discuss it.

3. Legal Protest Launched Against Massive Nevada Fracking Plan  
   11/13/2017 – On this date, Ed LaRue receives copy of a protest letter submitted by Center for Biological Diversity to the Ely District of the BLM. Although Ed immediately distributes this letter to the Board, there is no opportunity for the Council to protest since we did not comment on the environmental documents, the deadline for comments being 9/18/2017. According to the CBD letter, mineral extraction through fracking could affect up to 388,959 acres in the Ely District Office, affecting 13,453 acres of “general” desert tortoise habitat and 3,604 acres of designated critical habitat. Larry LaPré confirms Ed’s conclusion and no additional action could be taken.

4. Navy’s Environmental Assessment (EA) for Management of Cuddeback Lands  
   11/15/2017 – On this date, Jeff Aardahl of Defenders of Wildlife informs Ed LaRue that scoping comments for an EA on the above referenced project are being solicited, and the deadline date is 12/4/2017. Ed distributes draft comments to the Board on 11/18/2017. Final letter submitted to the Navy on 12/4/2017.

5. Palen Solar Facility EIS  
   12/6/2017 – Al Muth sends Ed LaRue a notice of the proposed Palen Solar Project. Larry LaPré reviews the document on Ed’s behalf on 12/6/2017 indicating that there are protective measures in the EIS for tortoise and he thought there was no need to comment, which Ed distributed on 12/6/2017.

   12/7/2017 – Ed LaRue receives notice for the above project on 12/7/2017, which he distributes to the other Board members on 12/15/2017. Comments are due on 3/8/2018.

12/11/2017 – Ed LaRue receives a link to environmental documents from Jeff Aardahl of Defenders of Wildlife on 12/11/2017 for the preparation of an EIR/EIS affecting 3,500 acres on the northwestern corner of EAFB. Ed distributes the link to environmental documents on 12/15/2017. The first draft of the comment letter was distributed on 12/16/2017. With only the minimum endorsement, email to County and Air Force on 12/24/2017, although kicked back from Air Force (deadline is 1/12/2018, so there is still time). Ed follows up with a hard copy of the letter to EAFB on 1/4/2018.

8. PG&E Habitat Conservation Plan (HCP) and Environmental Assessment (EA)

12/21/2017 – On 12/21/2017, Ed LaRue receives a notice from Defenders of Wildlife that this HCP and EA for PG&E activities are available and comments are due by 1/19/2018. On 12/23/2017, Ed distributes the link to these documents to the Board, stating that he will not be able to comment given his work with PG&E. During the 1/6/2018 Board meeting, Larry LaPre agrees to take the lead on drafting this letter.

9. Paradise Valley Specific Plan

1/2/2018 – On 1/2/2018, Becky Jones forwards a notice for this project to Ed LaRue, which he immediately distributes to the Board.
Ecosystems Advisory Committee
Summary Table from 10/28/2017 to 1/6/2018

Current date for this latest table revision is: 1/6/2018

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>No.</th>
<th>Reference</th>
<th>Rec’d</th>
<th>Dist</th>
<th>Due</th>
<th>Sent</th>
<th>BJ</th>
<th>BP</th>
<th>CJ</th>
<th>CN</th>
<th>EL</th>
<th>GD</th>
<th>JH</th>
<th>JP</th>
<th>KB</th>
<th>KM</th>
<th>LL</th>
<th>MF</th>
<th>MQ</th>
<th>MT</th>
<th>PW</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>SB CO RCIS</td>
<td>Meeting 11/7/17</td>
<td>N/A</td>
<td>N/A</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>Ivins, UT project</td>
<td>11/10</td>
<td>N/A</td>
<td>N/A</td>
<td>N/A</td>
<td>PI</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>Nevada fracking</td>
<td>11/13</td>
<td>N/A</td>
<td>N/A</td>
<td>N/A</td>
<td>PI</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td>Cuddeback EA</td>
<td>11/15</td>
<td>11/18</td>
<td>12/4</td>
<td>12/4</td>
<td>R</td>
<td>PI/NA</td>
<td>R</td>
<td>PI/A</td>
<td>PI/Y</td>
<td>Y</td>
<td>Y</td>
<td>PI/Y</td>
<td>PI/Y</td>
<td>PI/Y</td>
<td>PI/Y</td>
<td>PI/Y</td>
<td>PI/Y</td>
<td>PI/Y</td>
<td>PI/Y</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5</td>
<td>Palen Solar</td>
<td>12/6</td>
<td>12/6</td>
<td>N/A</td>
<td>N/A</td>
<td>NA</td>
<td>PI</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6</td>
<td>NV Test Site LEIS</td>
<td>12/7</td>
<td>12/15</td>
<td>3/8/18</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7</td>
<td>EAFB Solar EIR/EIS</td>
<td>12/11</td>
<td>12/15</td>
<td>12/27</td>
<td>12/24</td>
<td>R</td>
<td>PI/A</td>
<td>R</td>
<td>PI/A</td>
<td>PI/Y</td>
<td>Y</td>
<td>Y</td>
<td>PI/Y</td>
<td>PI/Y</td>
<td>PI/Y</td>
<td>PI/Y</td>
<td>PI/Y</td>
<td>PI/Y</td>
<td>PI/Y</td>
<td>PI/Y</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8</td>
<td>PGxE HCP and EA</td>
<td>12/21</td>
<td>12/23</td>
<td>1/19/18</td>
<td>R</td>
<td>R</td>
<td>PI</td>
<td></td>
<td>R</td>
<td></td>
<td>R</td>
<td>PI</td>
<td></td>
<td>R</td>
<td>R</td>
<td>R</td>
<td>R</td>
<td>R</td>
<td>R</td>
<td>R</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9</td>
<td>Paradise Valley Specific Plan</td>
<td>1/2/18</td>
<td>1/2/18</td>
<td>2/15/18</td>
<td>R</td>
<td>R</td>
<td>R</td>
<td></td>
<td>R</td>
<td></td>
<td>R</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Codes: Y = Vote of Yes; N = Vote of No; PI = Provided input; Blank = No Response; R = Recused; A = Authors/Lead Board member; NA – Replied they were not able to respond by indicated date

BJ = Becky Jones, BP = Bruce Palmer, CJ = Cristina Jones, CN = Chris Noddings, EL = Ed LaRue, GD = Greer Dolby, JH = Judy Hohman, JP = Joe Probst, KB = Kristin Berry, KM = Ken MacDonald, LL = Larry LaPré, MF = Maggie Fusari, MQ = Mari Quillman, MT = Michael Tuma, PW = Pete Woodman