Final Final Final

# **Desert Tortoise Council Minutes of the Board of Directors Meeting**

# 8 June 2014 Wrightwood, California

The meeting was called to order by Bruce Palmer, Chairperson at 12:45 p.m. Action items are in blue, with responsible parties in red. Motions made, seconded, and approved (or not) are shown in bold red font.

**Attendees:** Kristin Berry, Glenn Stewart, Pete Woodman, Ken MacDonald, Michael Tuma, Cristina Jones, Jason Jones, Scott Abella, Maggie Fusari, Chris Noddings, Mari Quillman, Bruce Palmer, Becky Jones, Joe Probst, Ed LaRue. Cristina Jones and Jason Jones are welcomed to their first Board meeting, having been newly elected at yesterday's Strategic Planning Retreat (Retreat). **Absent:** None. **Guests:** None.

**A. Introductions:** Bruce Palmer oriented new Board members on printing reports, email etiquette (subject line for single topic; discretion in replying to one member or entire Board), etc.

**B. Review Agenda:** New issues were incorporated as needed.

C. Meeting Minutes of Executive Session on 20 February 2014 and Annual Business Meeting on 21 February 2014: Ed LaRue prepared draft minutes at the last Board meeting in Las Vegas, Nevada, which were distributed, reviewed, and discussed. Motion made (Kristin Berry), seconded (Joe Probst), and approved to accept the draft minutes with no changes as final.

**D. Review of Board actions since last meeting:** The Board approved the purchase of a computer for the Treasurer on 2/27/2014. The computer cost \$890±, including software. The Board also accepted nomination letters from Jason Jones and Cristina Jones and voted to pay their expenses to attend yesterday's Retreat.

### **E. Officer Reports:**

**1. Treasurer's Report**: The Treasurer's Report was distributed by Joe Probst, which included total assets of \$279,451.99 (\$20,693.49 checking account plus \$895.91 added on Friday; \$187,198.13 money market account; \$71,560.37 Edward Jones "rainy day fund" account). Joe Probst will analyze the accounting for the 2014 Symposium to determine if increased registration costs, auction items, or both were responsible for making about \$8,000 profit this year; it is unusual that income exceeds costs. Joe moved one of the accounts from a very low interest rate to one of 4%. Joe was asked to include his name on future Treasurer's Reports. Each Board member is asked to provide Joe with receipts or an email so he can reimburse Board member's travel expenses (Bruce Palmer will modify reimbursement policy to show Joe's current address: 4654 East Ave. S 257B, Palmdale, CA 93552; mileage is reimbursed at \$0.555/mile with origins, destinations, and activities identified). Motion made (Ken MacDonald), seconded (Glenn Stewart), and approved to accept the Treasurer's Report as final.

2. Corresponding Secretary's Report: Becky Jones will update the contact list to include Cristina Jones and Jason Jones. Council received a response to a comment letter on the translocation of tortoises in southern Nevada. Becky also received a pack of letters from a Texas elementary school, thanking us for saving the tortoise. It would be good to respond with some recognition, perhaps in the form of stickers, posters, pencils, etc. Michael Tuma will publish one of the letters in a newsletter. • Becky Jones will send one or more copies of "Tortoises Through the Lens" to the school children.

**3. Newsletter Editor's Report**: Michael Tuma is the current Newsletter Editor. He wants the newsletter to reflect our role as the premier organization promoting tortoise recovery. He urged us to submit original materials, rather than cut-and-paste existing stories (some of which are copyrighted). Some ideas for stories included provide a review on recent tortoise publications; current research; activities of the Board that would refer the general membership to the website for more detailed information; acknowledge outstanding actions of Council members; submit photographs; descriptions of Council events like Symposium, Workshop, this weekend's Retreat, etc.; may want to interview authors of recent papers for their perspective; feature board members, in particular, and work through the ranks, perhaps two per issue, including Glenn Stewart and Kristin Berry in the newsletter preceding the 40<sup>th</sup> Symposium; some version of all committee reports highlighting accomplishments; a monthly column such as "your Council in review;" advocate social media opportunities; publish availability of Council items, such as hats, t-shirts, and stickers if and when they are produced; solicit stories from general membership. Scott Abella will review and comment on Michael Tuma's article on a certain cattle rancher in Nevada, recently in the news.

All newsletters are to be posted on the website, and would be emailed to active members. Some members still want hardcopies, which we need to resolve as there's no current process for producing and distributing them. Michael Tuma will ensure the newsletter is printed on good quality paper and has a professional appearance. He intends to produce quarterly newsletters.

4. Membership Coordinator's Report: No official written report. Thanks to Maggie Fusari for reworking the existing membership database. There has been a recent influx of new members. Mari Quillman will work with Mary Cohen to find a qualified firm to organize and update the existing database, and ask that Mary Cohen identify at least three potential entities by the next Board meeting. • Mari Quillman will develop a list of member attributes that we want to comprise the data base, and ensure that members' personal information is secure and not vulnerable to hackers. Mari Quillman will review the Desert Tortoise Preserve Committee's data base as an example. The Board would like to have the membership data base functional by September to be ready for both the Workshop and Symposium.

**5. Social Media**: Chris Noddings reported we now have 19 Tweets, including 13 since the last meeting. Mari Quillman will have an expert contact Chris Noddings to facilitate our social media programs. • Chris Noddings will coordinate with other Board members who will begin creating a strategy for using various social media.

#### F. Committee Reports:

**1. Ecosystems Advisory Committee Report**: There was clarification earlier this year that Ed LaRue will be signatory to all letters, regardless of author(s). Ed distributes out-of-state projects to Board members in those states for personal contact and attention to pertinent projects.

**a. Harper Lake Road**: Initiated by a request from the Desert Tortoise Preserve Committee in January 2014, Ed LaRue took data on fence gaps along Harper Lake Road, and San Bernardino County repaired the fence within two weeks of receiving the gap map.

**b.** Springbok/Oryx Solar Sites: The Council participated with proponent and Desert Tortoise Preserve Committee to provide for meaningful studies and mitigation, which have now been implemented.

**c. Silurian Valley Solar**: Important milestone as this was the first proposal in California to use variance lands under the Programmatic Solar EIS, adopted by the BLM several years ago. The Council made the deadline and is waiting to see if BLM will pursue environmental review in a formal EIS.

**2. Awards Committee Report**: Glenn Stewart indicated there have been no nominations thus far for the awards to be presented at the next Symposium. Nominations should include background information and be submitted no later than the end of December.

**3. Grants Committee**: Glenn Stewart received a proposal from Barry Sinervo, Phil Rosen, Rafael Lara Resendiz, and Mercy Vaughan to study the effects of climate change on the thermoregulation of tortoises in Mexico, which uses an existing model. The results may help determine if a third species of *Gopherus* occurs in the Sinaloa area. Kristin Berry cautioned that the name of a "new species," which has yet to be identified, must be excluded from the research proposal. The researchers have asked for \$2,741 to fund the study. The proposal was reviewed by Glenn Stewart, Maggie Fusari, and Michael Tuma who unanimously support the research. **Motion made (Glenn Stewart), seconded (Ken MacDonald), and unanimously approved to provide the requested amount of \$2,741, so long as researchers not refer to a specific name of a new species of** *Gopherus***.** 

**4. Workshop Discussions**: Maggie Fusari indicated the fall workshop will be available for enrollment the second week of July. She will contact pertinent board members on specific logistics affecting their duties. November 1-2 and 3-4, 2014 are the dates for the two workshops in Ridgecrest, California.

Cristina Jones, Bruce Palmer, Maggie Fusari, and Pete Woodman are on the committee to organize a Morafka tortoise workshop for early September 2014. This will be a pilot workshop that will evolve to accommodate the listing (or not) of this tortoise species, and will focus on field techniques.

An advanced techniques workshop is also being discussed; Maggie Fusari will redistribute her issues paper regarding this potential workshop. Jason Jones indicated he is pursuing the potential for a health assessment workshop to replace the one USFWS is relinquishing. This will likely be a collaborative effort among several groups, with the Council wanting to take the lead. Pete Woodman and/or Kristin Berry would likely take the lead for the Council on this advanced workshop when the time is appropriate.

# 5. 40<sup>th</sup> Annual Symposium Discussions:

**a. Local Host Committee**: Ken MacDonald will take the lead on this; he is meeting at Sam's Town in Las Vegas, Nevada day-after-tomorrow to sign the contract for the 2015 Symposium, which will be our 40<sup>th</sup>. Jason Jones will likely be the committee chair for the 2016 Symposium, which will also be at Sam's Town. Ken MacDonald should ask Sam's Town if they can accommodate 300 people, assuming that many may attend.

**b. Program Committee**: No thank you notes were distributed for donated items following the 2014 Symposium. The theme of the 2015 Symposium will focus on "40 Years of Success," with a keynote on this topic. The Johns Hopkins book on tortoises is scheduled to be published this summer, and can serve as the book-signing this year. Kristin Berry may invite a few scientists associated with this publication to talk about other species of turtles. Kristin Berry may develop a session on hyper-predation. Ed LaRue will develop the timeline of Council successes over the past 40 years. Michael Tuma and Chris Noddings will work on developing commemorative materials ("swag") associated with the 40<sup>th</sup> Anniversary.

#### G. Discussions of Old and New Business:

1. Desert Tortoise Conservation Center (DTCC): Bruce Palmer has taken the lead on this. USFWS has asked the Council to formulate a committee to determine if and how the DTCC may remain open. This should be a multi-agency group addressing the many issues that are currently leading to its closure by the end of October 2014. Within the next two weeks, Bruce Palmer will meet with Ken MacDonald and Scott Abella in Las Vegas as the committee to begin to consider this issue, and may consider having the coordination meeting facilitated. Bruce Palmer will invite various other affected parties. Motion made (Joe Probst), seconded (Becky Jones), and unanimously approved to fund Bruce Palmer's trip to Las Vegas.

2. How to Implement Strategic Planning Accomplishments: Jason Jones and Cristina Jones will work on identifying contacts for other agencies. • Ed LaRue will produce the 40-year timeline. • Michael Tuma will coordinate drafting Best Management Practices. • Kristin Berry will contact Tracy Bailey about latest draft of the Symposium manual. • Bruce Palmer will work with Mari Quillman to define the functioning role of the Membership Coordinator. Motion made (Bruce Palmer), seconded (Joe Probst), and approved for Mari Quillman to spend up to \$350 to frame a copy of "The Matriarch" to be presented to the Retreat facilitators, Linda Mitrovich and Heidi Brannon for their excellent work this weekend.

**H. Next Meeting**: The next business meeting of the Board will be at the DoubleTree Hotel in Ontario, CA on 23 August 2014, between 09:30 a.m. and approximately 4:00 p.m.

I. Adjourn: The meeting was adjourned by Chairperson, Bruce Palmer, at 15:15.

Draft minutes were recorded, later distributed and modified with board member review and input, then respectfully submitted as this final version by Ed LaRue, Recording Secretary.

6022RA

Edward L. LaRue, Jr. Desert Tortoise Council, Recording Secretary

Final Minutes of Board of Director's Meeting of the Desert Tortoise Council on 8 June 2014

#### Ecosystems Advisory Committee Report DTC Board Meeting of 8 June 2014

Note: The table attached to this report on the last page follows the **bold red** numbered outline given below.

#### 1. Searchlight Wind Energy Project

1/12/2014 – Ed LaRue receives editorial comments from Maggie Fusari on the final letter that was sent out on 1/8/2014, so no action at this time. 1/15/2014 – Scott Cashen sends email to Ed LaRue asking about detectability of tortoises during surveys: Are tortoises found in burrows to be included in the USFWS formula for density estimates? LaRue responds with a "yes" and carbon copies Pete Woodman to be sure. On 1/20/2014, Pete confirms that both aboveground tortoises and those visible underground are included in the formula, which Ed forwards to Scott. On 2/3/2014 Scott Cashen sends declaration of lawsuit to Ed, who distributes it to the Board.

#### 2. <u>Soda Mountain Solar Project – Draft EIS</u>

1/15/2014 - On 1/9/2014, project representatives promised to send pdf files of Pete Woodman's 2013 survey results on 1/13/2014. On 1/15/2014, Ed LaRue sends an email to Board members, intended for Jeffrey Childers of the BLM and Bechtel, asking for approval of the email before submission. After receiving input from MF and approvals from MQ, MT, and CN, Ed sends the modified email to the BLM and various environmental groups on 1/15/2014. On 1/19/2014, Ed LaRue sends email to Janna Scott and Jeff Childers asking for Peter Woodman's 2013 tortoise report, which has still not been provided, although promised on 1/9/2014. On 1/20/2014, Ed LaRue sends an email to Susanne Heim of Panorama Consultants asking for Kiva's report. On 1/21/2014, Ed LaRue receives a link for the report from Alexandra Kostalas and a pdf of the report from Larry LaPre, which Ed immediately circulates. Ed distributes draft comment letter to the Board on 2/25/2014. With positive endorsements from six Board members, Ed emails the letter to the BLM on 3/1/2014.

#### 3. <u>Harper Lake Road Fence Damage</u>

1/15/2014 – After receiving concerns from Kristin Berry that the Harper Lake Road fence may have been damaged by routine road maintenance, Ed LaRue sent a letter of inquiry to Mary Logan of DTPC. After receiving her response, Ed indicated the Council will wait to hear from her and Jun Lee is there is anything we need to do, which was reaffirmed on 1/16/2014 following a detailed explanation from Jun Lee. On 5/10/2014, Ed sends a memo to Jun Lee, Kristin Berry, and Tom Egan tabulating and mapping the locations of 69 fence breaches he recorded during a drive through on 5/8/2014. On 5/16/2014, Ed receives confirmation from San Bernardino County (Milo Rivera) that those portions of the fence damaged by county graders will be repaired next week, the week of 5/19-5/20.

#### 4a. Springbok & Oryx Solar in Kern County – Formal Comments

1/14/2014 – Mary Logan of DTPC sends a letter and link to two new solar projects that Kern County planning department would attach to the Beacon Solar project that was certified in 2012. With only marginal reconnaissance surveys in September 2013, the county proposes to add an addendum to the certified EIR with no additional environmental review. Draft letter was circulated by Ed LaRue on 1/16/2014. After receiving input from three Board members and concurrence from one other, Ed LaRue distributes the comment letter to Kern County, regulatory agencies, and pertinent environmental groups on 1/20/2014. On 1/21/2014, LaRue forwards a letter from Center for Biological Diversity contesting the addendum and indicating a meeting on 1/21/2014 with project proponents. On 1/21/2014, also receive email from Dave Hacker of CDFW that our letter has been forwarded to Lisa Gymer who is handling the project for CDFW. On 1/23/2014, receive email from Mary Logan indicating DTPC hand-delivered our comment letter to the proponent on 1/21/2014.

#### 4b. Springbok & Oryx Solar in Kern County – Settlement with DTT, DTPC, CBD

2/6/2014 – Ed LaRue receives an email with attachments from Mary Logan of DTPC, which include settlement measures between three environmental groups and the project proponents. Without being able to review them, Ed distributes her email to all Board members, asking for their independent review. Ed reviews the available documents on 2/8/2014 and asks someone on the distribution list to provide a version of the letter that we can modify with our official input. On 2/9/2014, Ed LaRue includes or comments in the letter and distributes it to Board members, Mary Logan, and Ron Banger of the DTPC, asking that they not distribute the letter until we have Board consensus. 2/11/2014, Ed forwards Glenn Stewart's excerpt on heat island effects to Mary Logan. After receiving one recusal, six endorsements, including three with comments, our formal letter was sent to Mary Logan and others on the evening of 2/12/2014, in time for their conference call with the client in the morning. On 2/19/2014, Ed LaRue receives final letter from 8minutenergy that incorporated all our comments, and sends an email to the proponent (ccing Board members) thanking them for considering our concerns.

#### 5a. Tortoise Translocation of DTCC Captives into Eldorado Critical Habitat Unit

1/17/2014 – Jeff Aardahl sends a letter to Ed LaRue commenting to the BLM on the proposed release of 600 captive tortoises from the Desert Tortoise Conservation Center (DTCC) into the Eldorado CHU. On 1/19/2014, LaRue asks Aardahl if he can distribute the comment letter to other Board members. On 1/21/2014, Aardahl gives his permission to circulate the document, which LaRue does. On 2/24/2014 Ed receives inquiry from Ileene Anderson about release of DTCC captive tortoises into the Eldorado DWMA and critical habitat unit. Ileene sends a copy of the December 2013 draft translocation plan on 2/26/2014 and a copy of their formal comment letter to the BLM on 2/27/2014. Ed LaRue distributes these two items to the Board asking them for input on 2/27/2014. Ed distributes the draft comment letter to the Board on 3/6/2014. After receiving four comments and one endorsement, the final letter was distributed to the Board on 3/10/2014, in time for the Las Vegas MOG meeting on 3/11/2014. Final version of the letter sent on 3/14/2014 after receiving six endorsements between 3/12 and 3/13. On 4/14/2014 receive BLM response from Becky Jones, which is dated 4/7/2014.

#### 5b. Support for Western Watershed Project's Formal Appeal of Eldorado Translocation

4/25/2014 – Michael Connor sends copy of formal appeal by Western Watershed Project and Defenders of Wildlife on this project, which Ed LaRue distributes to the board later that day. On 4/26/2014, Maggie Fusari distributes draft letter supporting formal appeal of this proposed project. Later that day, Ed LaRue makes a few edits and redistributes the revised version to all board members. With sufficient endorsement, the formal letter was submitted to USFWS on 4/28/2014.

#### 6a. Fremont Preservation Project – Workshop Notes

1/20/2014 – Receive flyer from Pete Woodman announcing a public meeting on the Fremont Preservation Project at Jawbone Canyon tomorrow night! In spite of being an affected party, we received no direct notice of this workshop. Ed LaRue spends most of the day reviewing the Draft EIR and the County's staff report addendum, writing up comments, and distributing them to the Board at 9:15 p.m. on 1/20/2014. Several emails are sent to the county and instigator, Paul Decker, to better understand how the 1/21/2014 workshop is to function. On 1/21/2014, LaRue receives a response from Craig Murphy of Kern County that indicates it will be worthwhile to attend. Concurrence is received from GS, CN, and JP, so Ed LaRue circulates the final notes that will be taken. LaRue and Pete Woodman attend the public meeting in Cantil on 1/21/2014. On 1/25/2014, send workshop notes to Mark Faull of Red Rock Canyon Interpretative Association.

#### **6b.** <u>Fremont Preservation Project – Formal Comments</u>

1/25/2014 – Ed LaRue finalizes formal comments on the Fremont Valley Preservation project and distributes it to all Board members for review, comment, and a vote. After receiving comments from CN and GS, and endorsements from BJ and JP, the letter was emailed to Kern County on 2/2/2014. Lorelei Oviatt of Kern County acknowledges receipt of our comments on 2/3/2014.

#### 7. Potential Plaintiff for Silver State South Solar Project

1/21/2014 – Ed LaRue receives an email from Stephanie Dashiell asking if the Council would like to join Defenders of Wildlife as a plaintiff on the above project, which we did formally protest in October 2013. Ed circulates her email to the other Board members and Sid Silliman for discussion and a vote. Having heard nothing, Ed sends an email to Bruce Palmer on 2/2/2014 asking him to poll the Board. In the absence of any feedback, Bruce Palmer redistributes the original email request of 1/21/2014 on 2/3/2014. A flurry of emails is received on 2/3/2014, with four recusals and three feedbacks captured in table. Ed sends emails to Stephanie Dashiell on 2/3 and 2/4/2014, asking for clarification. On 2/6/2014, Ed speaks with Stephanie Dashiell, discovering that she inadvertently referred to plaintiff when what she needed were individuals with personal experience in the area, so no action items after this date. Jeff Aardahl confirms. On 2/19/2014 a notice is widely distributed indicating BLM and USFWS have approved both the State Line and Silver State South solar projects.

#### 8. Chocolate Mountains Aerial Gunnery Range Proposed Land Withdrawal Renewal

1/30/2014 – Tracy Bailey emails announcement to Ed LaRue. Ed visits the website on 2/2/2014. This notice is for the Final EIS; public comment for the Draft EIS was October-November 2012, and we were not on the distribution list at that time. Given that this is a final, and Ed LaRue worked on the biology for the project, there seems to be no opportunity to comment at this time. Even so, Ed distributes the information to the Board on 2/2/2014.

#### 9. <u>Blythe Solar Power Project</u>

2/6/2014 – An anonymous source provides Ed LaRue with a BLM notice of the Draft EIS to construct the Blythe Solar Power Project of 4,100 acres of public lands. Written comments are due within 45 days, or 3/24/2014. On about 3/17/2014, Ed sends an email to the Board indicating he will not be able to review and comment on this project; except for one request from Chris Noddings asking if anyone can fill in, there were no responses, so this project (the first) fell through the cracks.

#### **10.** Interstate 11 and Intermountain West Corridor Study

2/11/2014 – Ed LaRue receives a notice on this project, which he forwards on 2/12/2014 to Maggie Fusari, Bruce Palmer, and Ken MacDonald since it is an Arizona-Nevada project. Maggie responds later that day that there is a lot to review but she will look into it and get back to Ed. On 3/1/2014 Ed sends an email to Maggie asking her for an update on this project. After input from Maggie, on 3/2/2014 Ed sends letters to Arizona and Nevada departments of transportation asking to be an affected interest. On 3/24/2014, Maggie indicates that she has signed up to receive all additional information for this project. On 5/2/2014, Ed sends Maggie an invitation to public for a stakeholder's meeting on May 21 that he received on 4/28/2014, to which she responds, she is now registered to attend the meeting in Tucson. On 5/12/2014, Ed forwards another notice to Maggie and asks the proponent to send future emails to Maggie rather than Ed. On 5/21/2014, Maggie attended a meeting on this project and will continue as our contact.

#### **11.** <u>Moapa Solar Energy Center Final EIS</u>

2/17/2014 – Ed LaRue receives the notice, dated 2/7/2014, today from Tracy Bailey. Ed sends an email to Chip Lewis at Bureau of Indian Affairs on the same day asking about a due date for comments. Chip responds on 2/18/2014 that the due date for comments is 3/20/2014. Chris Noddings indicates on 2/25/2014 that his company is working on this, so he is recused. Ed distributes Draft 1 of the comment letter to the Board on 3/13/2014. On 3/20/2014, Ed sends the final comment letter and receives confirmation several days later that it was received in a timely manner and will be considered in BIAs response to comments matrix.

#### 12. <u>Silver State Solar Protest Response from BLM</u>

2/26/2014 – Tracy Bailey sends scanned copy of certified letter from BLM regarding the Councils formal protest of the Silver State Solar protest. The letter indicates some of our protest was valid and others not, and that they effectively addressed the valid points, and approved the project anyway. The copy of the certified letter was distributed to the Board on 2/27/2014.

#### 13. Position Paper on the Closure of the Desert Tortoise Conservation Center

2/28/2014 – Ken MacDonald sends latest draft of the letter to Ed LaRue, who, after some edits, distributes it to the rest of the Board on 3/1/2014. After receiving comments from Maggie, Kristin, and Glenn, Ed redistributes the latest version on 3/2/2014. Seven Board members provide input on 3/3/2014! The final version of the letter was delivered by Bruce Palmer and Maggie Fusari to the Management Oversight Group on 3/11/2014, and sent to Washington, D.C. (DoI Jewell, BLM Kornze, and USFWS Ashe), Nevada (BLM Tim Smith), and California (USFWS Lohoefener) on 3/14/2014. Within five minutes, USFWS Regional Director, Ren Lohoefener responds with a contact number to call, which I forward to the board, and particularly Bruce Palmer. Having heard nothing, on 3/30/2014 Ed sends email to Bruce and Maggie asking if we have accepted Lohoefener's offer. Bruce responds on 3/31/14 that he did talk to Ren and he will follow up with Ed later.

#### 14. National Conservations Land Endorsement Letter

3/5/2014 – Josh Berkowitz (Conservations Lands Foundation) contacts Ed LaRue about sending formal NCL designation letter, which Board members officially endorsed on 8/30/2013. I advised him that Bruce Palmer should represent the Council as the Chairperson, which Bruce agreed to in a follow-up email. The letter will be submitted to BLM tomorrow with the Council recognized as one of 16 environmental groups.

#### 15. <u>Clark County BLM Notice of Recreation and Public Purpose Lease for 15 acres</u>

3/6/2014 – Ed LaRue receives a notice from the BLM, dated 2/15/2014, indicating that 15 acres of public lands are being transferred from BLM to Clark County to establish a park next to an elementary school in the community of Moapa. The notice was circulated with no action identified.

#### 16. Proposed Release of Tortoises into Hidden Valley

3/12/2014 – Ed LaRue receives translocation plan from Jeff Aardahl for releasing tortoises into Hidden Valley, Nevada. Ed distributes this to the Board the same day. Michael Tuma agrees to write the letter on 3/12/2014. On 3/14/2014, Ed distributes an email indicating our only options are a formal protest or appeal, attaching similar documents for the Silver State South protest the Council posted in October 2013. A draft letter is circulated by Michael Tuma, with substantial input from Maggie Fusari, on 3/19/2014. Glenn Stewart points out on 3/27/2014 that the final letter has not been circulated, endorsed, or submitted. Final letter submitted on 4/1/2014 to BLM on Nevada.

#### 17. Silurian Valley Solar – Consideration for Variance Lands

3/27/2014 – Having incidentally received notice of this project from the California Wilderness Coalition on 3/21/2014, Ed LaRue attends the Barstow public meeting on 3/27/2014. He distributes the notes he took to the Board members as background information for the comment letter due by 4/28/2014. This is the first solar project proposed for Variance Lands under the 2012 Solar PEIS in California, so is precedent setting. Ed sends emails to Mickey Quillman and Joan Patrovsky of BLM asking for letters and Sapphos' bio report on 4/3/2014. On 4/17/2014, receive email from BLM that comment period has been extended through 5/28, which Ed forwards to other board members on 4/20/2014. Ed distributes the draft comment letter to all board members on 5/12/2014. After getting a few comments and enough endorsements, Ed sends the final, formal comments to the BLM on 5/25/2014, three days before the final deadline. Receive immediate feedback BLM has received the comments, which are forwarded to Ileene Anderson, Sid Silliman, Jeff Aardahl, and Michael Connor.

#### 18. <u>Transfer of Cuddeback Gunnery Range to China Lake NAWS</u>

4/29/2014 – Ed LaRue and Bruce Palmer receive email from Mary Logan of DTPC announcing withdrawal of 25,000 acres of Cuddeback Gunnery Range, presumably to be used by the Navy. On 5/2/2014, Ed sends Mary's email to the board and responds to see if there is additional information to be reviewed. As of 5/25/2014 there has been no new feedback or action items identified for this project.

#### 19. Glacial Minerals Gold Mine at Dragonfly Placer Claims with El Paso Mountains

6/2/2014 – Chris Noddings sends information to Ed LaRue about this project, which he received from Center for Biological Diversity. Lisa Belenky of CBD provided Chris with additional information, which indicated at least four tortoises had been found during exploratory activities. Due to field work, Ed has not been able to do anything with this; so no action as of **6/5/2014**. CBD is drafting a comment letter for the public comment due date of 6/17/2014. Nothing new to report as of 6/5/2014.

# Ecosystems Advisory Committee Summary Table from 11 January 2013 to 7 June 2014

## Current date for this latest table revision is: 6/8/2014

			Board Member Responses															
			Dates	(2014)		Codes: $\mathbf{Y}$ = Vote of Yes; $\mathbf{N}$ = Vote of No; $\mathbf{PI}$ = Provided input; <b>Blank</b> = No Response; $\mathbf{R}$ = Recused; $\mathbf{A}$ = Authors												
No.	Reference	Rec'd	Dist.	Due	Sent	BJ	BP	CN	EL	GS	JP	KB	KM	MF	MQ	MT	PW	SA
1	Searchlight Wind Energy Project	11/7/13	1/3/14 2/3/14	N/A	1/8/14				PI 1/15 1/20				<b>R</b> 6/8	PI 1/12			PI 1/20	
2	Soda Mountain Solar Draft EIS	12/2/13	2/25/14	3/3/14	3/1/14	PI/ <b>Y</b> 1/6		PI/ <b>Y</b> 2/28	PI/A 2/25	PI/ <b>Y</b> 2/27	<b>Y</b> 2/27		<b>Y</b> 2/26				<b>R</b> 1/15	<b>Y</b> 2/27
3	Harper Lake Road Fence	1/11/14	FYI	N/A	5/10/14				PI/A 1/15									
<b>4</b> a	Springbok & Oryx Solar Comments	1/14/14	1/16/14	N/A	1/20/14				PI/A 1/16 1/21	PI/ <b>Y</b> 1/17	<b>Y</b> 1/17		PI/ <b>Y</b> 1/16				PI/ <b>Y</b> 1/20	
<b>4b</b>	Springbok & Oryx Solar Settlement	2/6/14	2/6/14 <b>2/9/14</b>	2/27/14	2/12/14	<b>R</b> 2/10	<b>Y</b> 2/11	PI/ <b>Y</b> 2/12	PI/ <b>A</b> 2/9	PI/ <b>Y</b> 2/11	<b>Y</b> 2/10		<b>Y</b> 2/9	PI/ <b>Y</b> 2/9				
<b>5</b> a	Release of DTCC tortoises into Eldorado	1/17/14 2/26/14	2/27/14 <b>3/6/14</b>	ASAP	3/14/14	<b>Y</b> 3/13	<b>Y</b> 3/12,13	PI/ <b>Y</b> 3/7	PI/ <b>A</b> 3/6	PI/ <b>Y</b> 3/7, 13	<b>Y</b> 3/7, 3/13	PI/Y 2/26, 3/12	<b>Y</b> 3/13	PI/ <b>Y</b> 3/7		PI 3/13		PI 3/12
5b	Support letter for WWP formal appeal	4/26/14	4/26/14	4/28/14	4/28/14	PI/ <b>Y</b> 4/28		PI/ <b>Y</b> 4/28	PI/ <b>Y</b> 4/26	PI/ <b>Y</b> 4/26			PI/ <b>Y</b> 4/27	PI/ <b>A</b> 4/26	PI/ <b>Y</b> 4/28			
<u>6a</u>	Fremont Valley Preservation Workshop	1/20/14	1/20/14	1/20/14	1/21/14			PI/ <b>Y</b> 1/21	PI/A 1/20	PI/ <b>Y</b> 1/21	<b>Y</b> 1/21						PI 1/20	
6b	Fremont Valley Preservation Comments	1/20/14	1/25/14	3/18/14	2/2/14	<b>Y</b> 1/28		PI/ <b>Y</b> 1/27	PI/A 1/25	PI/ <b>Y</b> 1/28	<b>Y</b> 1/27							
7	Plaintiff on Silver State South Solar Project	1/21/14	1/22/14	N/A	N/A	PI 2/5	PI 2/4	PI 2/3	PI 1/21	PI 2/3		<b>R</b> 2/3	<b>R</b> 2/3	PI 2/5	<b>R</b> 2/3	<b>R</b> 2/3	PI 2/5	
8	Chocolate Mtn Final EIS	1/30/14	2/2/14	N/A	N/A				<b>R</b> 2/2									
9	Blythe Solar Project Draft EIS	2/6/14	N/A	3/24/14	Missed deadline	Project fell through the cracks with no formal comment (a first)												
10	Interstate 11 Corridor	2/11/14	2/12/14	N/A	3/2/14				PI/ <b>A</b> 3/2				<b>R</b> 6/8					
11	Moapa Solar Energy Final EIS	2/17/14	3/13/14	3/20/14	3/20/14		PI/ <b>Y</b> 3/14	<b>R</b> 2/25	PI/A 3/13	PI/ <b>Y</b> 3/14	PI/ <b>Y</b> 3/14		<b>R</b> 6/8	PI/ <b>Y</b> 3/18			PI/ <b>Y</b> 3/20	
12	BLM's response for Silver State Protest	2/26/14	2/27/14	N/A	N/A	FYI Distribution												
13	Desert Tortoise Conservation Center	2/28/14	3/1/14 3/2/14	3/7/14	3/14/14		PI/ <b>Y</b> 3/3	PI/ <b>Y</b> 3/3	PI/ <b>Y</b> 3/1	PI/ <b>Y</b> 3/2	<b>Y</b> 3/3	PI/ <b>Y</b> 3/1,2,3	PI/ <b>A</b> 2/28	PI/ <b>Y</b> 3/1	PI/ <b>Y</b> 3/3	PI/ <b>Y</b> 3/3	PI/ <b>Y</b> 3/3	

Draft Minutes of Board of Director's Meeting of the Desert Tortoise Council on 8 June 2014

			D (	(2014)		Board Member Responses												
				(2014)	~ .	Codes: $\mathbf{Y} = \text{Vote of Yes}$ ; $\mathbf{N} = \text{Vote of No}$ ; $\mathbf{PI} = \text{Provided input}$ ; $\mathbf{Blank} = \text{No Response}$ ; $\mathbf{R} = \text{Recused}$ ; $\mathbf{A} = \text{Authors}$												
No.	Reference	Rec'd	Dist.	Due	Sent	BJ	BP	CN	EL	GS	JP	KB	KM	MF	MQ	MT	PW	SA
14	NCL Designation Letter to BLM	3/5/14	N/A	N/A	N/A		PI 3/5		PI 3/5									
15	Clark Co. RPP for Moapa Public Park	3/6/14	3/6/14	N/A	N/A	FYI Distribution												
16	Hidden Valley Tortoise Release	3/12/14	3/12/14	ASAP	4/1/14			PI/ <b>Y</b> 3/19,20	PI 3/14 4/1 <b>Y</b>	PI 3/18,19 3/28 <b>Y</b>		PI 3/12,20		PI/A 3/14,18,19,2 8,31 Y		PI/ <b>A</b> 3/18,19		
17	Silurian Valley Solar Variance Consideration	3/21/14	3/27/14	5/28/14	5/25/14			PI/Y 3/28 5/20	PI/ <b>A</b> 3/27	PI/ <b>Y</b> 5/18	<b>Y</b> 5/12		<b>Y</b> 5/12	<b>Y</b> 5/20			<b>Y</b> 5/23	
18	Cuddeback land transfer to NAWS	4/29/14	5/2/14	N/A	N/A				PI 5/2									
19	Glacial Minerals Gold Mine	6/2/14	-	6/17/14				PI 6/2	PI 6/2									

BJ = Becky Jones, BP = Bruce Palmer, CN = Chris Noddings, EL = Ed LaRue, GS = Glenn Stewart, JP = Joe Probst, KB = Kristin Berry, KM = Ken MacDonald, MF = Maggie Fusari, MQ = Mari Quillman, MT = Michael Tuma, PW = Pete Woodman, SA = Scott Abella