

Final Final Final

**Desert Tortoise Council
Minutes of the Board of Directors Meeting**

**26 October 2013
DoubleTree Hilton, Ontario, California**

The meeting was called to order by Bruce Palmer at 10:00 a.m. **Action items are in blue, with responsible parties in red. Motions made, seconded, and approved (or not) are shown in bold red font.**

Attendees: Attendees: Pete Woodman, Chris Noddings, Ken MacDonald, Maggie Fusari, Bruce Palmer, Kristin Berry, Mari Quillman, Tracy Bailey, Mike Bailey, Becky Jones, Joe Probst, Dan Pearson, Ed LaRue. **Absent:** Heidi McMaster, Glenn Stewart. **Guests:** Ciara Byrne, documentary filmmaker, joined the meeting via cell phone.

A. Introductions: Ciara Byrne was introduced on the phone to the Board by Bruce Palmer.

B. Review Agenda: The agenda was detailed enough that no new issues were added.

C. Meeting Minutes of 17 August 2013: After being recorded by Chris Noddings, with input from Bruce Palmer, Ed LaRue prepared minutes (“Final Draft Minutes”) for the last Board meeting at DoubleTree Hilton, Ontario, CA, which were distributed, reviewed, and approved with a few changes. Bruce Palmer cautioned that since the minutes are posted on the website, we need to be accurate about what is being stated and by whom. We should avoid mentioning people not on the Board. General discussions for award nominations and grant discussions should be recorded but details should not be in the minutes. **Bruce Palmer will review Robert’s Rules of Order to see if minutes should identify persons making and seconding motions.** Ed LaRue indicated his willingness to eventually produce a separate document listing approved and disapproved motions. **Motion made (Joe Probst), seconded (Becky Jones), and approved to accept the draft minutes as amended to be final.**

D. Review of Board actions since our last meeting:

1. Grants Policy approval: The final Grants Policy was distributed via email to all Board members on 22 August 2013.

2. PHP Scriptwriter: With 14 of 15 Board members voting “yes” in emails to Bruce Palmer, the Council approved expenditure of \$600 and a lifetime membership for John Donoghue on 22 August 2013.

3. Turtle Conservation Fund grant: With 13 Board members voting “yes” in emails to Bruce Palmer, this \$2,500 grant was approved on 11 September 2013, and the check mailed to the Turtle Survival Alliance soon thereafter.

4. Symposium registration fees: With 12 Board members voting “yes” to change Symposium registration fees in various emails to Bruce Palmer, the following fees for the 2014 Symposium were accepted by majority vote on 2 October 2013:

Member registration	\$200	\$250 late
Student member	\$75	\$100 late
Non-member	\$250	\$300 late
Student non-member	\$110	\$125 late
One-day	\$100	\$140 late (no change)
Spouse	\$75	
Dues	\$30	(no change)

5. Board discussion process using email: After discussion, all agreed that an online quorum would still comprise a majority of the Board membership, which is currently 8 of the 15 members. Bruce Palmer will edit Article IV, Section 4 of the Bylaws to clarify email voting. **Motion made (Dan Pearson), seconded (Kristin Berry), and approved to have Bruce Palmer develop wording to amend the Bylaws to reflect that email voting still requires a quorum of the Board.** The Chairperson generally does not make or second motions, and is responsible to manage votes, including providing updates and the status of a given vote.

E. Officer Reports:

1. Treasurer’s Report: Mike Bailey provided the Treasurer’s Report, which indicated an overall total of \$283,845.47 as of 10/23/2013. The Council has provided approximately \$8,250 in grant monies this year. Given anticipated costs of about \$5,000 for motels, we are likely to pay slightly more money this year than will come in. The insurance costs \$5,215, which covers Board activities and insurance for the Workshop. **Mike Bailey will work with Joe Probst to transfer the Edward Jones account from Ridgecrest to Palmdale. Motion made (Dan Pearson), seconded (Joe Probst), and approved to accept the Treasurer’s Report as final.**

Bruce Palmer distributed three draft policies, including Financial Reimbursement and Reasonable Cost Policy, Duties and Responsibilities of Treasurer, and Financial Management Policy. Reimbursements are addressed in the first policy, and generally do not cover individual meals (Board meetings are an exception). What is our policy for reimbursing mileage? About 95% of reimbursements are presented as gas receipts; reimbursement is based on the current federal rate, which is now 55.5 cents/mile. General consensus that receipts and mileage are both acceptable; both require that either the receipt or a note indicating how many miles were driven are to be submitted to the Treasurer for reimbursement. There is a consensus that the current federal rate for mileage is acceptable for all Board members and other official representatives (e.g., for Workshop instructors). For the Treasurer policy, **Bruce Palmer asked that Mike Bailey provide examples of the following reports:** Quarterly report, annual report, audit report, Symposium budget, and Workshop budget that can be attached to the policy as examples. **Motion made (Joe Probst), seconded (Kristin Berry), and unanimously approved to adopt the Financial Reimbursement and Reasonable Cost Policy, Financial Management Policy, and Duties and Responsibilities of the Treasurer as written.**

2. Corresponding Secretary’s Report: Tracy Bailey continues to provide environmental documents to Ed LaRue for comment. She had several newsletters available today to anyone wanting them. **Tracy Bailey will work with Becky Jones to transfer the post office box from Ridgecrest to Palmdale.**

a. Newsletter: The spring newsletter was distributed on September 26th, and the winter newsletter is due to be released on December 1st, so submissions are due by November 15th. Sean Daly must ensure officer positions are accurate. **Tracy Bailey** will see that the winter newsletter has pertinent Symposium information relative to registration, photo contest, etc.

b. Website: Mary Cohen has done a great job posting various pieces of information. A Council member has pointed out that some of the state regulatory information on the website (possibly in the “Answering Questions” document) is inaccurate. **Kristin Berry** will communicate with this person to resolve any inaccuracies.

3. Membership Coordinator’s Report: Mari Quillman led the following discussions.

a. Membership database: Using an intern, the data base has been updated for active members. **Maggie Fusari** will provide new members associated with the 2013 Workshop.

b. Email program: There has been no new communication with Mary Cohen on the MailChimp software. Now that new members have been identified, **Mari Quillman** can now use the data base to contact inactive members.

c. Membership operations policy and priorities: Nothing new on this policy.

d. Marketing: **Mari Quillman** will provide information to all participating Board members about soliciting new memberships via Linked-In.

e. Twitter: Chris Noddings explained that Twitter serves as a kind of email; rather than identify who receives the message, it is available to all people wanting to access it. We need to be careful and professional about what information is released. Announcing the Symposium or Workshop would be great; editorial opinion pieces should be avoided. **Motion made (Dan Pearson), seconded (Maggie Fusari), and approved to have Chris Noddings establish a Council Twitter account.** We will discuss a potential Facebook account at a future meeting. **Chris Noddings** will send an email explaining how we can access the Twitter account.

F. Committee Reports:

1. Awards Committee: Nancy Karl (Mojave Desert Land Trust) and Shelton Douthit (Shelton Douthit Consulting, LLC) have been informed their groups will receive Glenn Stewart Service Awards. There have been no nominations for the James St. Amant Award or Annual Award. Other entities have been identified for the Pat von Helf Award and the Robert C. Stebbins Award. **Kristin Berry** will inform these people about their awards.

2. Ecosystems Advisory Committee:

a. EAC operations, conflict of interest, and recusal policies: Ed LaRue has implemented a new tabulated format to keep track of projects, subsequent actions, and Board members providing (or not) input and comments. With a few exceptions (e.g., endorsement of National Conservation Lands - NCL), there is still minimal input from some Board members. There have not been any comment letters written that could not be sent for lack of minimal endorsement. We clarified there must be at least three Board members in addition to the author before a comment letter can be distributed as final. If Ed is having difficulty getting enough votes for a particular issue, Bruce Palmer indicated that he will intercede. If a Board member provides comments, Ed recognizes that as official endorsement of the letter after it has been modified. If position or policy statements are developed, these could be included in comment letters.

b. Tracking websites; notifying agencies to locate pertinent projects: Not discussed.

c. Silver State Solar formal protest: Most of our comment letters regard environmental documents, but the formal protest against this project in southern Nevada was a first for the EAC since Ed LaRue replaced Sid Silliman. Ken MacDonald recused himself from discussions and voting on the initial comment letter and from this formal protest.

d. Desert Renewable Energy Conservation Plan: Since April 2013, Ed LaRue attended two meetings with San Bernardino County supervisors and submitted a letter to the DRECP staff endorsing DWMA status. The rumor as of late summer was that the draft plan would be made public at the end of October. Given the importance of this plan, there needs to be far more Board support than recently given to project review and comment letters.

e. Ecosystem Advisory Committee Policy and Conflict of Interest and Recusal Policy: Contrary to point 7 as written, several members stated that we should identify documents as inferior and then follow up with specific ways to remedy the deficiency. **Motion made (Joe Probst), seconded (Kristin Berry), and approved to adopt both the Ecosystem Advisory Committee Policy and Conflict of Interest and Recusal Policy as written, after clarifying point 7 in the EAC policy as given above.**

3. Grants Committee:

a. Tortoise Through the Lens Grant: On 12 September 2013, Glenn Stewart informed David Lamfrom via email that his grant request for \$2,500 was accepted for this Spanish language book.

b. Turtle Survival Alliance Grant: A half-dozen copies of the soft cover book, "Turtle Survival," which resulted in part from our grant funds, were distributed.

c. Grant Request from Turtle Survival Alliance (TSA) on Radiated Tortoise: Although this is a worthy proposal, focused on husbandry, the Council has recently contributed funds to TSA, and will not further consider this grant request of \$4,700. **Motion made (Dan Pearson), seconded (Kristin Berry), and approved that the Council not consider this request further based on lack of available funds for international projects.** • Glenn Stewart will inform TSA of this determination. • **Motion made (Joe Probst), seconded (Ken MacDonald), and approved that we not fund any additional international projects in 2013.**

d. Preliminary Grant Request for Sterilization of Pet Desert Tortoises: This preliminary proposal from several tortoise biologists in Nevada was distributed. It may lead to a grant request, but was tabled at this time. **Bruce Palmer asked that all Board members review this preliminary proposal and be prepared to discuss it at a future Board meeting.**

4. Workshop Committee: The two Workshops are scheduled for 2-3 and 4-5 November 2013. At this time, neither Workshop is filled, with about 75 students assigned to each one. Maggie Fusari asked that we extend this year's registration to next year for one participant who cannot attend due to a family emergency, which all agreed. Mike Bailey has arranged for Mexican lunches, which will serve 75 people. **If Board members have any input on the test, please provide feedback to Maggie Fusari asap.** Neither of the two Nevada USFWS biologists invited to the Workshop can attend. Sean Daly is prepared to post the test for us. Pete Woodman, Becky Jones, Ed LaRue, and Maggie Fusari (chairperson) comprise the Workshop Committee. **Maggie Fusari is incorporating all pertinent information into the operations manual, including materials and procedures.** • **Bruce Palmer will talk to the DTRO about potential additional Workshops.** • **Ed LaRue should add a question to the Ask-It Basket to see what new topics/skill sets the students would like to add to future Workshop agendas.**

5. Symposium Discussions: The 39th Annual Symposium is scheduled for 20-23 February 2014 here at the DoubleTree Hilton in Ontario, CA.

a. Local Host Committee: Tracy B. is commended for outstanding coordination.

i. Registration fees and process: The registration form is on the website.

ii. Facilities/meals/schedule: Same as last time here at the DoubleTree.

iii. Workshop/field trips: **Pete Woodman will contact Mary Logan** of the DTPC, maybe with Jun Lee's involvement, to arrange a field trip to the DTRNA on Thursday, the day before the Symposium. We usually have between 0 and 20 participants.

iv. Audio-visual equipment: David Carr, from ECORP Consulting, has agreed to oversee audio-visual presentations; **Kristin Berry will bring some back up equipment.**

v. Volunteers: Same volunteers from last year will be here again.

vi. Photo contest: **Joe Probst is running the photo contest, and will email Mary Cohen about a website announcement.** There are nine categories, so we need nine panels.

vii. Raffle/auction: We will raffle items the day before and at other times so that it is not too long on Saturday night. Mari Quillman is overseeing this, and would appreciate help and contributions from all who can assist her. Maggie Fusari brought back a painting from Australia. Mari will pursue buying photographs from a local photographer in Hesperia. Big Sky has agreed to make another donation this year.

viii. Vendors: **Mari Quillman will work with Mary Cohen to solicit vendors on the website.** Chris Noddings has a list of last year's vendors and a few new ones have talked to **Mari Quillman, including the Hesperia photographer.** • **Chris Noddings will contact various vendors and help them with set up logistics.** • **Mari will update the form for potential sponsors and have May Cohen publish the solicitation on the website.** • **Ed LaRue will announce the 2014 Symposium at the 2013 Workshop next weekend.**

ix. Flyers/announcements/marketing: All Board members are asked to attend Thursday night to stuff envelopes. Board members/speakers will have colored name tags.

b. Program Committee:

i. Session topics: Kristin Berry reported golden eagles, headstarting, translocation, and (potentially) raven studies will be among the presentations. She is talking to one last USGS contact on golden eagles. We can expect several scientists to present results on various headstarting programs, including the effects of crowding in headstarting pens. **Becky Jones will follow up with pertinent researchers on recent raven studies.**

ii. Agency session: Not specifically discussed.

iii. Poster session: Kristin Berry was not sure how many people will present posters, although we should provide at least eight panels for their use. **Maggie Fusari will look into additional poster presentations.**

iv. Featured speakers: Kristin Berry, with help from Maggie Fusari, will contact one researcher on a potential presentation (maybe keynote speaker) on environmental effects of solar fields, and another scientist on species cohabitation in Texas tortoise burrows.

v. Evening presentation: Laura Cunningham has agreed to talk about pre-settlement California, and will be on hand to sign her book, "A State of Change."

vi. Tribute to Dr. Robert Stebbins: With unanimous Board approval, we are happy to dedicate this Symposium to Dr. Stebbins!

G. Discussions of Old and New Business:

1. Board vacancies: The Treasurer and Corresponding Secretary positions will be vacated when Mike Bailey and Tracy Bailey, respectively, leave the Board following the 2014 Symposium. Joe Probst has already agreed to be the new Treasurer and Becky Jones has agreed to be the new Corresponding Secretary. **Bruce Palmer will pursue several people from Utah, which is a high priority for geographical representation. Motion made (Joe Probst), seconded (Ken MacDonald), and approved to adopt the Appointment of Board Members at Large policy as written.**

2. Four Policy Statements for Tortoise Translocation: At the last Board meeting there was a motion to pay an independent scientist to develop the following four policy statements, but that person is no longer interested.

a. Desert Tortoise Conservation Center: The newspaper article on euthanizing so many tortoises produced widespread criticism from the public. The original plan has been changed on several occasions so that those requirements are no longer applicable. Even so, several permits may still be reliant on the functioning of the DTCC, and closing it may violate one or more permits. Under Clark County's MSHCP, the DTCC was intended to receive tortoises displaced by development, but the center soon began accepting captives, and no longer receives developer's fees needed to keep it open. The DTCC was originally associated with the Summerland Development to receive about 830 tortoises and to function in perpetuity for tortoise research.

Should the Council provide funding relative to the DTCC? We need to address the role of recovery, if any, associated with the DTCC. Members expressed they wanted to keep the DTCC open, not dump tortoises in the field, and not euthanize them. Should not focus on raising money but rather educate the public about the proper function of the DTCC, which is still unclear. Most of the \$400,000/year is spent maintaining the fences, caring for tortoises, etc. Providing \$1,500 for a documentary (see next paragraph) is a relatively small commitment; the difficulty is determining what we'd hope to accomplish with such a film, who the audience will be, how we distribute it, etc.

Ciara (pronounced Kee-rah) Byrne is a documentary filmmaker who has produced award-winning films on environmental issues who joined us via speaker phone. She has expressed interest in producing a documentary about the DTCC. What should the focus be? And how much input would the Council have? She and her partner comprise a nonprofit entity that is concerned about environmental issues, and particularly endangered species. They are currently focusing on elementary schools in Clark County, Nevada, having raised \$100,000 since March 2013 to develop vegetable gardens at 20 schools.

A documentary on the DTCC could identify what has been done, what is being done, and what will likely happen; it could function as a fundraiser to support keeping the DTCC open. A fundraising campaign like this would typically function for about 60 days. The documentary could identify daily operations of the DTCC; multi-agency involvement; housing both captive and displaced wild animals; a source of tortoises released into the field. A typical documentary for vegetable gardens has been three minutes; maybe five minutes for the DTCC would be sufficient, and the Council would have full input in the product. There are production costs but no additional costs to distribute it to local schools, businesses, media, etc. Production costs would cover several days of filming and editing, and are estimated at \$1,200 to \$1,500.

Today the Council formulated an *ad hoc* committee of **Ken MacDonald** (chairperson), **Dan Pearson**, and **Peter Woodman** to begin to consider and develop the purpose and function of this film. • By the end of November, the **committee** should have identified objectives associated with producing the film. • **Ken MacDonald** will let Ms. Byrne know about the status of our decision. One early product of this committee needs to be a letter to pertinent agencies that will identify our objectives and intent to produce this film.

b. Translocation of tortoises within the wild: **Maggie Fusari** will look at recent discussions on tortoise translocation but feels that this information is dated and requires more recent data. **Maggie Fusari** will work with **Pete Woodman** to gather recent translocation studies.

c. Fence removal from the Large-Scale Translocation Site: **Jeff Aardahl** has been keeping track of removing the LSTS fence, and may be willing to draft a policy for us, or share his information. **Ken MacDonald** will work with **Jeff Aardahl** on this policy statement.

d. Release of captive tortoises into the wild: **Kristin Berry** agreed to draft this policy, with help from **Maggie Fusari**, who will provide minutes from a recent discussion session on this issue.

3. Desert Tortoise Recovery Office (DTRO) funding priorities in Nevada: We have questions with regards to: How much of the DTRO budget is spent on in-house issues versus throughout the listed range? How much is going to section 7 consultations under the Federal Endangered Species Act? How much of the budget is targeted for issues in California? **Bruce Palmer** has agreed to initiate discussions with DTRO biologists for feedback on these issues.

4. Bylaws amendments: Maggie Fusari feels strongly that Article IV, Section 2 needs to be changed to reflect fair nominations of new Board members. **Motion made (Maggie Fusari), seconded (Pete Woodman), and rejected by all other Board members present to delete the clause “age, gender” from Article IV, Section 2.** • **Motion made (Maggie Fusari), seconded (Joe Probst), and unanimously approved to add the following amendment to Article IV, Section 2 of the Bylaws: “Board members should be willing to commit time and energy to important tasks and be willing to serve as officers or other designated capacity.”**

5. Archives update: Ed LaRue received several boxes of materials from Glenn Stewart in June 2013, but has yet to catalogue these materials. **Ed LaRue** drafted a “call for archives materials” blurb that he will have **Mary Cohen** published on the website; will work with **Sean Daly** to get this solicitation into the newsletter; will work with **Bruce Palmer** to develop a draft archival policy; and eventually will contact past officers for archival materials.

6. Develop a Council Power Point: Ed LaRue has represented the Council on four occasions in 2013, with upcoming presentations in November 2013 and January 2014. Although he represents himself as a Council Board member, he is presenting a personal slide show of his own work. He would like to see the Council develop a slide show that is more indicative of our concerns and efforts. Are the groups interested in what the Council does or individual member's research? **Ed LaRue is willing to develop an outline for a presentation that could be used for public outreach.** • **Ed will ask CTTC members for their input at his next two appearances**

7. Betty Burge Memorial: Nothing new to present at this time.

8. Operations Manual:

a. Duties of officers and Board members: Today we looked at the duties and responsibilities of the Treasurer, but all officer descriptions need to be included in the manual. **Anyone willing to develop descriptions for each officer is encouraged to do so.** • **Bruce Palmer will circulate the latest operations manual for input and feedback.**

9. 25 January 2014 is 40th Anniversary Celebration of DTPC: Kristin Berry encouraged us to have good DTC Board representation at this special event.

G. Next Meeting: The next business meeting of the Board will be at here the DoubleTree Hotel in Ontario, CA between 10:00 a.m. and approximately 4:00 p.m., on 11 January 2014.

H. Adjourn: The meeting was adjourned by Chairperson, Bruce Palmer, at 16:10.

These final minutes were recorded and respectfully submitted by Ed LaRue, Recording Secretary.



Edward L. LaRue, Jr.
Desert Tortoise Council, Recording Secretary

Ecosystems Advisory Committee Report
DTC Board Meeting of 26 October 2013

Note: As of this EAC report, based on input from Ken MacDonald, Ed LaRue is now using a summary table to keep track of different environmental documents and board member responses. The table is attached to this report on the last page and will follow the **bold red** numbered outline given herein. Unlike previous reports where the response dates were given below, from here on, the dates are included in the table, only.

1. Arizona Strip Route Designation

8/2/2013 – Ed LaRue receives a news release from the BLM Arizona Strip Field Office indicating they plan on pursuing route designation on the Arizona Strip, with a deadline for comments of 9/11/2013. Using information provided by Maggie Fusari on 8/18/2013 and draft minutes on the board meeting on 8/17/2013 provided by Chris Noddings on 8/21/2013, Ed distributes a draft comment letter to the entire board on **8/30/2013**. On **9/1/2013**, Ed distributes hyperlink that includes subregion maps to all board members. On **9/5/2013**, Chris Noddings provides extensive comments on the deficiency of the EA and suggested changes to the letter. On **9/11/2013**, with four votes of “yes,” Ed circulates the letter for one last review before sending it to the BLM in the afternoon.

2. TransWest Express Transmission Line Project

8/22/2013 – As an action item identified at the board meeting on 8/17/2013, Ken MacDonald sends a link to the board that shows a map of the proposed transmission right-of-way. Comments are due to the BLM by **9/30/2013**. On **9/24/2013**, Ed LaRue distributes a draft comment letter to the board. After receiving insightful comments from Chris Noddings and Ken MacDonald, Ed redistributes the revised draft on **9/25/2013**. After receiving comments from Bruce Palmer on 9/26/2013, which tallied five yes votes, Ed sends final letter on **9/27/2013**.

3. Impending closure of Clark County Desert Tortoise Conservation Center

8/25/2013 – Tracy Bailey distributes AP article entitled, “Desert tortoise faces threat from its own refuge.” There is no action item associated with this article, although there has been some discussion over the past year about the Council writing a letter to assist Roy Averill-Murray’s attempts to use the center for some other purpose. On **8/26/2013**, Bruce Palmer forwards a news release from the USFWS indicating that only sick tortoises are being euthanized and healthy tortoises are being reintroduced into the wild. On **8/27/2013** Bruce Palmer, representing the Council, participated on a panel with USFWS (Mike Senn) for an interview with KNPR in Las Vegas discussing issues associated with the DTCC. The interview lasted about 15 minutes and was broadcast live.

4. BLM designation of National Conservation Lands in the California Desert

8/24/2013 – Josh Berkowitz of Conservations Lands Foundation (CLF) sends letter asking if the Council would add its name to the list of supporters of nominating NCL lands. On **8/26/2013**, Ed LaRue circulates Josh’s letter to all board members seeking a vote, and sends his personal endorsement as a biological consultant. After receiving yes votes from 14 of 15 board members, the Council’s endorsement is emailed to Josh Berkowitz on **8/30/2013**.

9/12/2013 – Sam Goldman of Conservation Lands Foundation sends a letter announcing a series of three workshops in early October to further nominate NCL lands. Ed LaRue distributes this announcement to board members on the same day, indicating he still plans on developing a nomination letter. On **9/19/2013**, Ed LaRue circulates Council's draft letter reiterating DTPC's nominations of 8/5/2013 and further nominating all DWMA and tortoise critical habitat for NCL status. On **10/3/2013**, having heard from only Glenn Stewart, Bruce Palmer redistributes the letter and asks for input. On **10/11/2013**, having endorsement of the nomination letter from 10 members, Ed LaRue sends the nomination letter to Jim Kenna of BLM Sacramento, Dave Harlow of DRECP, Mary Logan of DTPC, Josh Berkowitz, and Sam Goldman both of CLF.

5. Desert Renewable Energy Conservation Plan (DRECP).

On **8/30/2013**, Ed LaRue receives notice of public meetings in Yucca Valley on the DRECP. On **9/1/2013**, Ed distributes the Council's comment letter from April 2013 and indicates he plans on representing the Council at the public meeting on 9/7/2013 on the DRECP. Board members are encouraged to provide any new comments that Ed can make in the public meeting to the county supervisors on **9/7/2013**. With only input from Chris Noddings, Ed attends the public meeting on 9/7/2013, and circulates minutes from the meeting to the board later that evening.

On **9/19/2013**, with encouragement from Glenn Stewart (9/8/2013) and concurrence from Chris Noddings (9/9/2013), Ed LaRue edits the minutes from the above meeting and distributes the formal draft comment letter to the board. Having received comments and concurrence from Chris Noddings, Glenn Stewart, Joe Probst, Bruce Palmer, and Ed LaRue (author), the comment letter is sent to David Harlow of the DRECP on **9/23/2013**.

6. Coolwater-Lugo Transmission Project

On **9/12/2013** Ed LaRue receives a notice from Tracy Bailey, dated 8/28/2013, addressed to Sid Silliman, providing a Notice of Application for a Certificate of Public Convenience and Necessity, including the following website on the project: www.sce.com/coolwaterlugo. This notice and website are circulated to the board but there appears to be no action item at this time. On **9/13/2013**, Kristin Berry asks about status of this; Ed responds with an email on **9/16/2013** to her, the board, and Sid Silliman that Sid may have commented but there is no opportunity now.

7. Silver State Solar South Project Supplemental Final EIS – Formal Comments

On **9/23/2013** Ed LaRue receives a notice for the Supplemental Final EIS and immediately distributes it to entire board for independent review. Jeff Aardahl of Defenders of Wildlife provides Ed with supplemental information on **9/24/2013**, which Ed immediately forwards to the board with Jeff's approval. After receiving four supporting documents from Sid Silliman, Ed forwards those documents to other board members on **9/25/2013**. Ed distributes the draft comment letter to all board members and Jeff Aardahl on **10/16/2013**. On **10/17/2013**, Jeff Aardahl suggests that we present a formal protest rather than a comment letter, so Ed sends an email to that effect and the revised letter with Bruce Palmer and Chris Noddings' edits on **10/18/2013**. Since there were four (and only four) board members endorsing the letter with the above changes, Ed sends the letter to the BLM on **10/19/2013**.

7. Silver State Solar South Project Supplemental Final EIS – Elevate to a Formal Protest?

On **10/17/2013**, Jeff Aardahl recommended that the Council elevate our comments to a formal protest. On **10/18/2013**, Maggie Fusari, Glenn Stewart, Chris Noddings, and Bruce Palmer indicated we should pursue the formal protest. Ed LaRue produces the draft formal protest letter on **10/19/2013** and distributes it to the board and Jeff Aardahl for comment. In the table, the second row marked as “**7.**” is to document those members wanting to pursue the formal protest. The third row marked as “**7.**” shows those members voting yes on the draft protest letter. Having received the minimum number of yes votes (Glenn, Maggie, and Pete) necessary, Ed emails the letter on **10/20/2013** and sends a hard copy on **10/21/2013**, which is the deadline (get an email later in the day from Jeff Aardahl that because of the recent government shutdown, there is a 16-day extension). Ken MacDonald was not involved in either the comment letter or protest, and formally recused himself from discussions and votes on this project on 10/28/2013.

8. Moapa Solar Energy Center Draft EIS

On **9/24/2013** Tracy Bailey sends announcement (dated 9/3/2013 and received by her on 9/18/2013) of availability of the Draft EIS and public meetings in Nevada on this project, which Ed LaRue immediately distributes to the board on the same day. Ken MacDonald replies that he (or Heidi) will attend one of the two public meetings and report back. Ken later attends one of the two meetings. On **10/3/2013**, Ed LaRue provides a quick draft comment letter to Ken and Pete Woodman for their review before distributing it to all other members. Having heard nothing from Pete or Ken, Ed circulates the letter to the entire board on **10/9/2013**. On **10/11/2013**, having received “yes” votes from four members (Ed, Chris Noddings, Glenn Stewart, and Joe Probst), Ed sends the final comment letter to the two BIA members listed on the public notice.

9. Maricopa Solar Park Project

On **10/11/2013** Tracy Bailey sends an announcement from the Phoenix, AZ district of the BLM announcing public meetings on 10/23 and 10/24 in Goodyear and Maricopa, AZ for this 1,730-acre proposed solar project. Ed LaRue distributes the announcement to the board later that day. Public comments are due on 11/4/2013. On **10/14/2013**, Maggie Fusari responds to Ed’s query asking if any tortoise habitat will be affected, saying she didn’t think so but that she will check with Christina Jones to be sure. On **10/15/2013** Bruce Palmer indicated that he did not think tortoises would be affected, prompting Ed LaRue to draft a one-page letter asking that the Council be removed from the Interested Party list, which was circulated to the board for approval. Having received yes votes from five members, Ed sends the letter on **10/16/2013** asking that we be removed from the list.

Note: Thanks to sometimes last minute input from various board members, we were able to make all indicated deadlines. Ed LaRue’s biggest concern is that a lot of effort could go into reviewing documents and drafting letters, and not receive the minimum of three additional votes to send the letter. Unfortunately we came close a few times. Of the six formal comment letters sent, three were sent with only the three additional votes needed and two were sent with only four additional votes. *We desperately need to have more involvement from more board members, or we run the risk of spending unnecessary time on comment letters that cannot be sent.*

Ecosystems Advisory Committee: Summary Table from 8/17/2013 to 10/26/2013
Current date for this latest table revision is: 10/28/2013

No.	Reference	Dates (2013)				Board Member Responses																
		Rec'd	Dist.	Due	Sent	BJ	BP	CN	DP	EL	GS	HM	JP	KB	KM	MB	MF	MQ	PW	TB		
1	AZ Strip Route Designation	8/2	8/30	9/11	9/11		PI/Y 9/3 9/11	PI/Y 9/5 9/11		A/Y 8/30 9/11	PI/Y 9/11		Y 9/11	PI 8/17		Y 9/1						
2	TransWest Transmission Line	7/18	7/21	9/30	9/27		PI/Y 9/26		A/Y 9/24	PI/Y 9/26	R	Y 9/25		PI/Y 8/22 9/25								
3	DTCC Closure in October 2014	Release on 8/25 from TB Rebuttal on 8/26 from BP				BP interview on 8/27		No action taken at this time on the initial news release (8/25) and subsequent USFWS rebuttal (8/26)														
4	Endorse letter supporting NCL's	8/24	8/26	ASAP	8/30	Y 8/28	Y 8/28	Y 8/28	Y 8/28	Y 8/26	Y 8/26	Y 8/28	Y 8/27		Y 8/28	Y 8/28	Y 8/26	Y 8/30	Y 8/28	Y 8/28		
4	NCL workshop in early October	9/12	9/12	10/1 10/2	N/A	No members attended this workshop, choosing instead to provide an independent nomination as #4, above																
4	Formal NCL nominations	6/4	9/19	ASAP	10/11		PI/Y 10/3	PI/Y 10/3	Y 10/4	A/Y 9/19	Y 9/23	Y 10/17			Y 10/4		Y 10/4	Y 10/4	Y 10/4	Y 10/4		
5	DRECP meeting with supervisors	8/30	9/1	9/7	9/7			PI 9/6		PI 9/7												
5	Supervisor comment letter	N/A	9/19	ASAP	9/23		Y 9/23	PI/Y 9/9 9/20		A/Y 9/19	PI/Y 9/8 9/20		PI/Y 9/20									
6	Coolwater-Lugo notice	9/12	9/12	None	N/A					PI 9/16				PI 9/13								
7	Silver State Solar Supplemental EIS	9/23	9/23	10/21	10/19		PI/Y 10/17	PI/Y 10/17		A/Y 9/23 10/16	PI/Y 10/16			PI 9/25	R	10/28						
7	Silver State Solar Formal protest?	10/17	10/18	10/21	N/A		Y 10/18	Y 10/18		A/Y 10/18	Y 10/18				R	10/28		Y 10/18				
7	Silver State Solar protest letter	10/19	10/19	10/21	10/20					A/Y 10/19	PI/Y 10/19				R	10/28		Y 10/20		PI/Y 10/20		
8	Moapa Solar Energy Center	9/24	9/24	10/22	10/11			PI/Y 10/9		A/Y 9/24 10/3	PI/Y 10/9		Y 10/10	PI 10/17	PI 9/24 10/1					PI 10/1		
9	Maricopa Solar Project	10/11	10/11	11/4	10/16		PI/Y 10/15 10/16	Y 10/16		A/Y 10/15	PI/Y 10/16						PI/Y 10/14 10/16					

BJ = Becky Jones, **BP** = Bruce Palmer, **CN** = Chris Noddings, **DP** = Dan Pearson, **EL** = Ed LaRue, **GS** = Glenn Stewart, **HM** = Heidi McMaster, **JP** = Joe Probst, **KB** = Kristin Berry, **KM** = Ken MacDonald, **MB** = Mike Bailey, **MF** = Maggie Fusari, **MQ** = Mari Quillman, **PW** = Pete Woodman, **TB** = Tracy Bailey